Volume 22 Issue 16



# The Three Tree Sale

The Mishnah (5:4) records the following debate. If someone purchased two trees in another person's field, according to the Chachamim, that is all they purchased. R' Meir however argues that he also purchased the land around the trees - the space necessary for one to pick the fruits. If however, one purchased three trees, then everyone agrees that the person also purchased the land. The Mishnah explains that this means that if the trees dies, he would be able to plant other trees in place of them. The Bartenura explains that once there are three trees it is considered an orchard. For that to be true, the Bartenura explains that the trees must be spaced no less than four amot and not more than sixteen amot apart.

The Gemara (81a) compares our Mishnah with a similar Mishnah in Bikkurim. There the Mishnah explains that if one purchased two trees in his friend's field, while he would still bring bikkurim from those trees, he would not perform the mikra bikkurim. Rashi explains that since it is not considered his land, he would not be able to say as part of the recitation, "the fruits of the land that You have given me". Once again R' Meir disagrees. Understanding that Mishnah will help us understand our own.

The Rambam (Bikkurim 2:13) rules that if one however purchased three trees in his friend's field, then "even though all he purchased was the trees, it is considered as if he purchased the land" and would therefore be able to perform the mikra bikkurim.

The Raavad argues, that the reason why he can recite the mikra bikkurim, is because, as we explained in our Mishnah, he acquires the land along with the trees also. How then do we understand the Rambam that is only "as if" he purchased the land?

The Grach explains that Rambam maintains that when purchasing three trees one does not also purchase the land. We do not consider the land as being *batel* to the trees as part of the purchase. What is different about the case when purchasing three trees, is that he has the right continue planting trees in that space.

If this is true, how then can he bring bikkurim from those trees? The Grach explains that the Rambam understands that since the individual has the perpetual right to keep planting the trees in that space, it is enough to be considered "the land You have given me."

One could ask that even if he purchased one tree, he has the rights to the land at least while the tree is standing. Yet, the Rambam rules in that same halacha that he would not be able to bring bikkurim from that tree. The Grach explains that purchasing a single tree is different. In that case, all he has is the rights for the tree to draw nutrients from that land.

Alternatively, purchasing a single tree is even worse than that. The purchaser of the single tree has no rights to the land at all. It is simply that the seller must ensure that the tree gets adequate nutrients, somewhere, so that that the tree he sold endures. When purchasing three trees, since he maintains the perpetual right in the land, as explained above, even though he did not purchase the land directly, it is indeed "as if he purchased the land" and he is able to declare that the fruits were from "the land You have given me".

This understanding explains why the Rambam rules that when purchasing a single tree, he could not even bring bikkurim. Compare this to a case where one purchased the peirut (fruit) of another tree. In that case the Gemara (Bava Batra 136b) rules that he mays still bring bikkurim yet not perform mikra bikkurim. Rashi there explains that he cannot perform mikra bikkurim since it is not "the land You have given me". Yet he can still bring bikkurim from that land since it satisfies the pasuk, "that you shall bring from your land". Rashi explains that pasuk is satisfied, since when he purchased that *peirut* there was a lien on that land on which the trees are located to enable it to produce that fruit. As explained, when purchasing a single tree however, there is no lien on the land at all.

Yisrael Bankier

#### Shiurim

### **Revision Questions**

בבא בתרא די :טי – וי :בי

- In what special case is everything that is in the field transferred to the other party? ('v: 'T)
- What are two cases are similar to the previous question? (די:טי)
- What is and is not included in the sale of:
  - A boat?
  - A wagon? (הי:אי)
- According to *R' Yehuda* when does the sale of a yoke include the ox that pulls it? (הי: אי)
- What are the three opinions regarding whether the sale of a donkey includes its equipment? (הי:בי)
- What has someone purchased if the rubbish comes with it? (הי:גי)
- If someone purchased honeycomb from a beehive, how much can he take? (ה׳ :ג׳)
- What is debated regarding the sale of two trees? (הי:די)
- List the three differences according to the *Tana Kama* between whether a person purchase two or three trees in another person's field? (הי:די)
- In what situation can the sale of a part of an animal include more than the stated part? ('π:: ה')
- Regarding the sale of wheat, when can the seller cancel the deal? When can the buyer cancel the deal? When can either cancel the deal? (List one example for each.) (*τ*: :*τ*)
- In what two ways are large amounts of fruit acquired? (הי: יזי)
- In what two methods is flax purchased? (הי: זי)
- During the sale of wine, at what point is the sale finished even in the face of fluctuating prices (and what is the case that the *Mishnah* describes)? (*π*: *π*)
- What is a *sarsur* and when is he responsible? (הי :חי)
- What is the debate regarding a case where a person sent his son with money, to a shop to purchase a oil? In what case is there agreement? (σ: :σ:)
- What obligations are placed on a shopkeeper based on the following *pasuk* (הי: יי):
  יימאזני צדק אבני צדק איפת צדק והין צדק יהיה לכםיי

(ויקרא יייט: לייו)

- Regarding the previous question, when does *Rabban Shimon ben Gamliel* maintain that these obligations do not apply? (הי: יייא)
- If a seller measured perfectly, what percentage must he add for dry goods? For liquids? (הי: (ייא))
- Can a buyer claim *mekach ta'ut* if he purchased fruit, and using them, was not able to grow fruit? (י:אי)
- If someone purchased figs, what percentage of wormy figs is acceptable? ('1: ב')

#### ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

> Rabbi Reuven Spolter mishnah.co

Rabbi Chaim Brown www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld Rabbi C. Brown http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calend ars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm

### APPS

Mishnah Yomit mishnahyomit.com

All Mishnah Orthodox Union

Mishna Yomi Our Somayach, South Africa

Kehati

#### SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss In US dial: 718 906 6400 Then select: 1 - 2 - 4

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
1 December	2 December	3 December	4 December	5 December	6 December	7 December
לי חשון	אי כסלו	בי כסלו	גי כסלו	די כסלו	הי כסלו	וי כסלו
Bava Batra						
6:3-4	6:5-6	6:7-8	7:1-2	7:3-4	8:1-2	8:3-4

## Next Week's Mishnayot...

