



## Gedi Mekulas and Roasted Meat

One of the three laws listed that *Rabban Gamliel* ruled leniently compared to the *Chachamim* was that he allowed a *gedi mekulas* on *pesach* night, whilst the *Chachamim* forbade it. The *Bartenura* explains that the *gedi mekulas* was a young goat that was roasted in the same fashion as the *korban pesach* – roasted whole with legs and intestines hanging on the outside.<sup>1</sup> This was done as a *zecher* (reminder) for that *korban pesach* that was offered when the *Beit HaMikdash* was standing. The *Chachamim* however forbade the practice since it gives the appearance that one is eating a *korban* outside the *Yerushalaim* in violation of a prohibition.

The *Mishnah* in *Pesachim* (4:4) however teaches that whether one ate roasted meat on *Pesach* night depended on the local *minhag*. The *Gemara* (*Pesachim* 53b) explains that those that would not, was because it appears that one was eating a *korban* outside.

The *Or Zarua* (*Pesachim* 230) understands from *Rashi* (74a, *eize*) that when the *Mishnah* explains that whether or not meat was eaten roasted was dependant on *minhag*, those places that forbade it, was only if it was prepared like a *gedi mekulas* but not any roasted meat. In other words, difference in *minhag* was depended on the debate in our *Mishnah* between *Rabban Gamliel* and the *Chachamim*.

The *Rosh* (*Pesachim* 4:6) however explains that roasting a *gedi mekula* is prohibited, irrespective of *minhag*. This is consistent with the opinion of the *Chachamim*. The difference in *minhag* is whether they forbade roasted meat more broadly. His position appears to be based on the

continuation of the *Gemara* that cites the *Tosefta* where the *Chachamim* rebuked *Todus* who had allowed the people of Rome to eat the *gedi mekula* on *Pesach* night.

The *Rashash* (on the *Mishnah Pesachim*) also understands like the *Rosh*. He adds that there is a potentially a difference between the *minhag* and the basic law preventing *gedi mekulas*. That difference would be found by *Pesach Sheni*. Considering that the law in our *Mishnah* is out of concern that it appears like the *korban* is eaten outside, then consuming a *gedi mekula* on *Pesach Sheni* should also be prohibited. That is because the concern would equally be present then. Concerning the *minhag* to expand the scope of the prohibition, it is possible to understand that the *minhag* was only to do so on *Pesach* and not *Pesach Sheni*.

The *Ran* (*Beitzah*, 12a *Rif*) notes that since our *Mishnah* only mentions a *gedi mekulas* – a young goat prepared in this fashion – it would not apply to a lamb. To explain, both a young goat and lamb can be used for a *korban pesach*. The difference however is that with a lamb, the *alya* (tail-section) must be offered on the *mizbach* with the other sacrificial parts, whereas for a *gedi* it can be consumed. The reason why only a *gedi mekulas* would be prohibited is because if it was a lamb, since the *alya* would still be attached, it would not resemble the *korban pesach*. The *Ran* however rejects this position. Once again this based on the incident cited with *Todus*. The *Ran* explains that in the *Tosefta*, the *Chachamim* took issue with *Todus* who permitted *telayim mekulasim* – imply that ruling applies equally to lambs.<sup>2</sup>

*Yisrael Bankier*

<sup>1</sup> The *Bartenura* explains that the term *mekulas* is used to describe an armed soldier, which the *korban* prepared in this fashion resembles.

<sup>2</sup> Interestingly, while that is the text in the *Tosefta*, the incident with *Todus* as cited in the *Gemara* only mentions the *gediim mekulasim*.

**Revision Questions**

עדינות ב' ח' – ג' י"א

- Which of the *halachot* that *R' Akiva* presented were accepted by the *Chachamim* and how many were rejected? (ב' ח')
- What attributes does a son usually inherit from his father? (ב' ט')
- According to *R' Akiva* which five things took twelve months? (ב' י')
- Explain the debate between *R' Dosa ben Harkinas* and the *Chachamim* about whether/how two half *kezzeitim* of a corpse can combine to be a source of *tum'ah*. (ג' א')
- How does *R' Meir* expand the debate between *R' Dosa ben Harkinas* and the *Chachamim*? (ג' א')
- What are the opinions of *R' Dosa ben Harkinas* and *Chachamim* regarding:
  - Pieces of food combining to become a source of *tum'ah*?
  - Redeeming *ma'aser sheni* with and *asimon*? (What is an *asimon*?)
  - Purifying hands that have become *tameh* for handling *mei chatat*? (ג' ב')
  - The status of *kenivat yarak trumah*?
  - The minimum measure of *reishit ha'gez*? (ג' ג')
  - *Chatzalot* and *tum'ah ve'taharah*?
  - Which type of netting can *mekabel tum'ah*? (ג' ד')
- Regarding which part of the *kelah* do they argue? What is a *kelah*? (ג' ה')
- Explain the opinion of the *Chachamim* that hold sometimes a *shevuyah* can eat *trumah* and sometimes she cannot. (ג' ו')
- What are the four *sfeikot* where *R' Yehoshua* is *metameh* and the *Chachamim* are *metaharin*? (ג' ז')
- What are the three things that *R' Tzadok* is *metameh* and the *Chachamim* are *metaharin*? (ג' ח')
- What are the four things that *Rabban Gamliel* is *metameh* and the *Chachamim* are *metaharin*? (ג' ט')
- Which three laws does *Rabban Gamliel* rule stringently like *Beit Shammai*? (ג' י')
- What are *Rabban Gamliel's* three *kulot*? (ג' י"א)

**Shiurim**

**ONLINE SHIURIM**

*Yisrael Bankier*  
[mishnahyomit.com/shiurim](http://mishnahyomit.com/shiurim)

*Rabbi Reuven Spolter*  
[mishnah.co](http://mishnah.co)

*Rabbi Chaim Brown*  
[www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/](http://www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/)

*Rabbi E. Kornfeld*  
*Rabbi C. Brown*  
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

**APPS**

*Mishnah Yomit*  
[mishnahyomit.com](http://mishnahyomit.com)

*All Mishnah*  
 Orthodox Union

*Mishna Yomi*  
 Our Somayach, South Africa

*Kehati*

**SHIUR  
 ON KOL HALOSHON**

*Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss*  
 In US dial: 718 906 6400  
 Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

**Next Week's Mishnayot...**

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
30 March א' ניסן	31 March ב' ניסן	1 April ג' ניסן	2 April ד' ניסן	3 April ה' ניסן	4 April ו' ניסן	5 April ז' ניסן
Eduyot 3:12-4:1	Eduyot 4:2-3	Eduyot 4:4-5	Eduyot 4:6-7	Eduyot 4:8-9	Eduyot 4:10-11	Eduyot 4:12-5:1

